

North Tyneside Council Report to Cabinet Date: 11 November 2013

ITEM 5(a)

Title:
Street Lighting Review

Portfolio(s): Housing and Environment
Sustainable Development

Cabinet Member(s): Cllr John Harrison
Cllr John Stirling

Report from: Overview and Scrutiny Committee

Wards affected: All

PART 1

1.1 Purpose:

The purpose of this report is to present the recommendations of the Environment and Culture Sub-Committee in relation to its review of street lighting.

In accordance with Section 122 of the Local Government and Public Involvement in Health Act 2007, Cabinet are required to provide a response to the recommendations of the Overview and Scrutiny Committee within two months. In providing this response Cabinet are asked to state whether or not it accepts each recommendations and the reasons for this decision. Cabinet must also indicate what action, if any, it proposes to take.

In providing this response Cabinet is asked to state whether or not it accepts each recommendation and the reasons for this decision. Cabinet must also indicate what action, if any, it proposes to take.

1.2 Recommendation(s):

It is recommended that Cabinet consider and formulate a response to the recommendations presented to them as a result of the overview and scrutiny review of street lighting.

1.3 Forward plan:

The report was included in the forward plan for the period 23 October 2013 – 28 February 2014 under the matters arising from Overview and Scrutiny Committee and its sub committees heading.

1.4 Council plan and policy framework

This report links to 'Our North Tyneside' Council Plan, particularly to Priority 2 – Our Places - to reduce the Borough's carbon footprint, as outlined in the 2013/14 Action Plan.

1.5 Information:

Background information

Environment and Culture Sub-Committee at their meeting on the 12 June prioritised a review of street lighting. The findings of the review would be reported back to Cabinet in the autumn and contribute towards the new lighting strategy for the borough. The main aim was to explore the different options for street lighting with a view of reducing energy consumption and to achieve efficiency savings.

It was agreed at the outset that the review would focus on:

- Exploring the different options for street lighting
- Consider the impact that these changes will have on local communities
- Consider the views of local people and stakeholders
- Recommend ways forward

Members of the sub-group included Councillors Gary Bell, Brian Burdis and Cath Davis.

In carrying out the review the sub-group met a number of times with Andrew Gate, Senior Manager for Commercial Partnerships and Phil Scott, Head of Environment and Leisure Services. They also attended an on-site demonstration of street lighting and initiated a two week trial of dimming and trimming in the Weetslade area. Trimming means that the lights are switched on and off at a lower lighting lux level. This saves energy as the lanterns come on a few minutes later at dusk and switch off a few minutes earlier at dawn each day.

As a result of the study the sub-group have identified four recommendations for submission to Cabinet, they are:-

- R1: That Cabinet ask the Head of Finance and Commercial Services to explore the three different business models with a view of purchasing and implementing the Mayflower central management system across the residential areas of the borough (see paragraph 6.9 of Appendix 1).
- R2: That Cabinet considers as part of the new lighting strategy to gradually phase in the dimming of street lights in residential areas across the borough to run at 75% power consumption from switch on and then reduce to 60% between midnight and 5.30am, and that street lights are trimmed in the evening and at dawn.
- R3: That Cabinet ask SSEC to accelerate the street lighting maintenance cycle so that dimming and trimming is in place across all residential areas in the borough by the end of 2014.
- R4: That Cabinet give further consideration to the option of part night switch off in non-residential areas.

The full report which outlines the key findings, conclusions and recommendations of the review is attached at Appendix 1.

1.6 Decision options:

The following decision options are available for consideration by Cabinet:

Option 1

Cabinet may accept the recommendation set out in paragraph 1.2 above.

Option 2

Cabinet may not accept the recommendation set out in paragraph 1.2 above.

Option 3

Cabinet may accept part of the recommendation as set out in paragraph 1.2 above and reject the rest.

Option 1 is the recommended option.

1.7 Reasons for recommended option:

Option 1 is recommended by Overview and Scrutiny.

The approval of the recommendations by Cabinet will facilitate the reduction of energy consumption and make both carbon and financial efficiency savings.

Full details of the costs and benefits of pursuing the recommendations are set out in the Overview and Scrutiny Report in Appendix 1.

Cabinet's attention is drawn to the following:-

- The current cost of energy is £1.76m (paragraph 5.4)
- The CEI programme targets for street lighting to achieve are £195k in 2013/14 and a further £148k in 2014/15 (paragraph 5.5). These are not achievable without the recommendations set out in this report being adopted.
- Adopting dimming and trimming in residential areas will save £203k per annum. (paragraphs 6.10 to 6.16).
- Further savings of around £93k per annum could be achieved from a part night switch off scheme (paragraphs 6.17 to 6.20) however this would need further analysis and work done to assess if it was a viable option.
- The proposals derive maximum benefit when combined with Central Management technology (Mayflower). The costs of Mayflower are not funded in the proposal. However 3 options to fund the approximately £500k set up costs have been identified and are set out in paragraph 6.9 of the appendix.

Cabinet are asked to provide reasons for any recommendations which are not approved.

1.8 Appendices:

Appendix 1:- Overview and Scrutiny Report - Street Lighting Review October 2013

1.9 Contact officers:

Andrew Gate, Senior Manager for Commercial Partnerships (0191) 643 6450

1.10 Background information:

- 1) Report of the Street Lighting Sub-Group - Street Lighting Review
- 2) North Tyneside Council Constitution

PART 2 – COMPLIANCE WITH PRINCIPLES OF DECISION MAKING

2.1 Finance and other resources

If Recommendation 1 which relates to purchasing and implementing the Mayflower central management system across the residential areas of the borough is accepted, consideration will need to be given to the resources required to purchase the system. Three potential business models are outlined the report, these are:-

- 1 Council to fund the purchase of the Mayflower units using money in the PFI Street Lighting Reserve. Future year's savings would then be used to re-instate the reserve to an appropriate level by the end of the Contract in 2029.
- 2 SSEC to fund by drawing down money in the PFI financial model set aside for the column replacement programmes in 2019 and 2024. In the first five years of the PFI 80% of lighting columns were replaced. The remaining columns were the newer columns installed in the 10 years leading up to the 2004 commencement of the scheme. These columns (known as "deemed-to-comply") are contractually due for replacement in two tranches by June 2019 and by June 2024. However modern street lighting columns are designed to last in excess of 40 years and therefore the majority of these columns should still be in good condition on their planned replacement dates. Instead the money could be used to purchase Mayflowers now and savings put aside to replace any columns that do need replacing during the life of the PFI. An audit of the structural condition of these deemed-to-comply columns is currently underway to confirm the feasibility of this option.
- 3 The Council and / or SSEC to apply for funding from sources such as SALIX and green investment funds. Other Councils including South Tyneside have been successful in obtaining funding for similar schemes via this route.

If Recommendation 2 is accepted as part of the new lighting strategy, which is to gradually phase in the dimming of street lights in residential areas across the borough to 75% power consumption then to 60% between midnight and 5.30am, and that street lights are trimmed in the evening and at dawn. It is anticipated that this will save over 5 million kwh of energy per year equating to 2,700 tonnes of CO₂ and create financial savings in the Contract of around £203,800 per annum.

2.2 Legal

The nature and the format of documentation required to implement the new street lighting strategy approved by Cabinet will be governed by the terms of the Street Lighting PFI

Project Agreement dated 31st March 2004 and made between the (1) the Council of the City of Newcastle upon Tyne and the Council of the Borough of North Tyneside (2) Tay Valley (Newcastle and North Tyneside) Limited which are to be entered into in accordance with the Financial Regulations and Contract Standing Orders of the Authority.

2.3 Consultation/community engagement

Resident's views were sought during the two week trial of dimming and trimming in the Weetslade area, this involved SSEC delivering 300 questionnaires throughout the Weetslade ward and asking residents for their views on the lighting output changes.

Other recent consultation included:

- During October 2012 as part of the public engagement carried out, there was a street lighting public meeting and walking tour
- In January and February 2013 as part of the budget consultation nine events relating to street lighting were carried out with residents and staff
- Officers met with Northumbria Police on 24 April 2012 to discuss options for street lighting energy saving including introduction of dimming into residential areas and the potential part night switch off schemes in non residential areas across the borough.

2.4 Human rights

There are no direct issues relating to human rights arising from this report.

2.5 Equalities and diversity

There are no direct issues relating to equalities and diversity arising from this report.

2.6 Risk management

There are no direct issues relating to risk arising from this report.

2.7 Crime and disorder

There are no direct issues relating to crime and disorder arising from this report. The PFI aimed to reduce crime and fear of crime through brighter illumination of streets at night. There is a small risk that reducing lighting levels under the dimming and trimming proposals put forward in the report may increase fear of crime for some residents. Members who attended the on-site demonstration (see paragraph 1.5 above) are satisfied that having seen the reduction of light level proposed, it is not really perceptible to the naked eye and that therefore this risk is minimal.

2.8 Environment and sustainability

If Recommendation 2 is accepted which is to consider as part of the new lighting strategy to gradually phase in the dimming of street lights in residential areas across the borough to run at 75% power consumption from switch on and then reduce to 60% between midnight and 5.30am, and that street lights are trimmed in the evening and at dawn. It is anticipated that this will reduce energy consumption by 5.18 million kilowatt hours per annum – an annual reduction of 2,784 tonnes of CO₂.

PART 3

The following officers and Members have been sent a copy of the report for their information:

- Chief Executive
- Mayor/Cabinet Member
- Chief Finance Officer
- Monitoring Officer